Real Estate Law







In this issue

SOUTH AFRICA

Transparency and co-operation should be the first steps in resolving real estate disputes



For more insight into our expertise and services

Transparency and co-operation should be the first steps in resolving real estate disputes

On 9 December 2024, the Supreme Court of Appeal (SCA) handed down judgment in *The Body Corporate of San Sydney v Shivani Singh and Others* (779/2023) [2024] ZASCA 169 (9 December 2024) in terms of which the order of the KwaZulu-Natal Division of the High Court, Durban was set aside and substituted with an order directing the respondents to sign whatever consent was required for the body corporate to obtain a certificate of real right in respect of the extension of the San Sydney Sectional Title scheme by the addition of three buildings that had been erected on the common property of the scheme, and to it exercising that right itself. Furthermore, should the respondents fail to sign such consent in whatever format required by the Registrar of Deeds, the Sheriff of the High Court was authorised and directed to sign the written consents on behalf of the respondents.

The SCA's judgment explored the relevant provisions of the Sectional Titles Act 95 of 1986 (STA) and the Sectional Titles Schemes Management Act 8 of 2011 (STSMA). These statutes are crucial when a body corporate seeks to obtain a certificate of real right to extend a scheme and to exercise, alienate and transfer such right to a third party. In this case, the body corporate found itself in a tricky situation when the developer, who had since been liquidated, built three additional buildings on the common property, after the original right to extend the scheme had expired.

To rectify the situation, the body corporate elected that the right of extension to complete the buildings and for the registration of the sectional title register to incorporate the three units, vested in it and should be sold and ceded to a third party, HF Property Investments (Pty) Ltd (HFP). To

facilitate this transaction, with the real right of extension having vested in it, the body corporate sought to obtain the issue of a certificate of real right of extension and the cession thereof to HFP.

However, in this instance, the body corporate would require the written consent of all unit owners and the mortgagees of the units within the scheme, as outlined in section 25(6) of the STA read with 5(1)(b) of the STSMA. These sections stipulate that such consent cannot be withheld without "good cause in law". Shivani Singh, a unit owner and the first respondent, refused to provide her consent. She argued that she had not been provided with sufficient information and that the sale of the right of extension effectively constituted an alienation of common property, which required a unanimous resolution from all members – a resolution that had not been obtained.





REAL ESTATE LAW ALERT

Transparency and co-operation should be the first steps in resolving real estate disputes

CONTINUED

The SCA's finding

The body corporate contended that Singh's refusal to consent was without good cause and argued that the sale of the real right of extension did not amount to an alienation of common property. The High Court agreed with Singh, but the SCA found differently in part. The SCA determined that the sale and cession of the extension rights did not involve an alienation of common property and, therefore, did not require a unanimous resolution. Nevertheless, the SCA conceded with the High Court that the refusal to consent was not without good cause due to the lack of sufficient material information provided to Singh.

As a result, the appeal failed on this "good cause in law" ground, and both parties were found to be at fault for not co-operating more fully with each other to resolve the issues at hand. Consequently, the SCA ordered each party to bear its own legal costs. The impact of this ruling goes beyond the immediate parties and the outcome thereof, emphasising the importance of transparent governance in sectional title schemes.

Additionally, the judgment highlights broader issues of trust and collaboration within community ownership structures. The court noted that poor communication, lack of transparency and the absence of constructive engagement between parties could lead to misunderstandings and distrust, particularly in financial matters and property rights. Consequently, the SCA recommended the use of alternative dispute resolution mechanisms, as well as processes afforded in terms of the Community Schemes Ombud Services Act 9 of 2011, prior to seeking legal recourse, encouraging all parties to promote transparency, co-operation and mutual understanding.

Simone Franks, Asisipho Kozana and Ashleigh Solomons





OUR TEAM

For more information about our Tax & Exchange Control practice and services in South Africa, Kenya, and Namibia, please contact:



Muhammad Gattoo
Practice Head & Director:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1174
E muhammad.gattoo@cdhlegal.com



Bronwyn Brown
Director:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1235
E bronwyn.brown@cdhlegal.com



Mike Collins
Director:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)21 481 6401
E mike.collins@cdhlegal.com



Simone Franks
Director:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)21 670 7462
E simone.franks@cdhlegal.com



Fatima Gattoo
Director:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1236
E fatima.gattoo@cdhlegal.com

Simone Immelman

Lydia Owuor



Director: Real Estate Law T +27 (0)21 405 6078 E simone.immelman@cdhlegal.com



Partner | Kenya T +254 731 086 649 +254 204 409 918 +254 710 560 114 E lydia.owuor@cdhlegal.com



Muriel Serfontein
Director:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1237
E muriel.serfontein@cdhlegal.com



John Webber
Director:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1444
E john.webber@cdhlegal.com



Alex de Wet
Director:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1771
E alex.dewet@cdhlegal.com



Natasha Fletcher Counsel: Real Estate Law T +27 (0)11 562 1263 E natasha.fletcher@cdhlegal.com



Samantha Kelly
Counsel:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1160
E samantha.kelly@cdhlegal.com



Bridget Witts-Hewinson
Senior Associate:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)21 481 6447
E bridget.witts-hewinson@cdhlegal.com



Lutfiyya Kara
Senior Associate:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1859
E lutfiyya.kara@cdhlegal.com



Sune Kruger
Senior Associate:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1540
E sune.kruger@cdhlegal.com



Lulama Lobola Senior Associate: Real Estate Law T +27 (0)21 481 6443 E lulama.lobola@cdhlegal.com



Ceciley Oates
Senior Associate:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1239
E ceciley.oates@cdhlegal.com



Henry Omukubi
Senior Associate | Kenya
T +254 731 086 649
+254 204 409 918
+254 710 560 114
E henry.omukubi@cdhlegal.com



Fatima Essa
Associate:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1754
E fatima.essa@cdhlegal.com



Muneerah Hercules
Associate:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1579
E muneerah.hercules@chdlegal.com



Zahra Karolia
Associate:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1701
E zahra.karolia@cdhlegal.com



Asisipho Kozana Associate: Real Estate Law T +27 (0)21 405 6168 E asisipho.kozana@cdhlegal.com



Ebun Taigbenu
Associate:
Real Estate Law
T +27 (0)11 562 1049
E ebun.taigbenu@cdhlegal.com

BBBEE STATUS: LEVEL ONE CONTRIBUTOR

Our BBBEE verification is one of several components of our transformation strategy and we continue to seek ways of improving it in a meaningful manner.

PLEASE NOTE

This information is published for general information purposes and is not intended to constitute legal advice. Specialist legal advice should always be sought in relation to any particular situation. Cliffe Dekker Hofmeyr will accept no responsibility for any actions taken or not taken on the basis of this publication.

JOHANNESBURG

1 Protea Place, Sandton, Johannesburg, 2196. Private Bag X40, Benmore, 2010, South Africa. Dx 154 Randburg and Dx 42 Johannesburg.

T +27 (0)11 562 1000 F +27 (0)11 562 1111 E jhb@cdhlegal.com

CAPE TOWN

11 Buitengracht Street, Cape Town, 8001. PO Box 695, Cape Town, 8000, South Africa. Dx 5 Cape Town. T +27 (0)21 481 6300 F +27 (0)21 481 6388 E ctn@cdhlegal.com

NAIROBI

Merchant Square, 3rd floor, Block D, Riverside Drive, Nairobi, Kenya. P.O. Box 22602-00505, Nairobi, Kenya. T +254 731 086 649 | +254 204 409 918 | +254 710 560 114 E cdhkenya@cdhlegal.com

NAMIBIA

1st Floor Maerua Office Tower, Cnr Robert Mugabe Avenue and Jan Jonker Street, Windhoek 10005, Namibia PO Box 97115, Maerua Mall, Windhoek, Namibia, 10020 T +264 833 730 100 E cdhnamibia@cdhlegal.com

STELLENBOSCH

14 Louw Street, Stellenbosch Central, Stellenbosch, 7600. T +27 (0)21 481 6400 E cdhstellenbosch@cdhlegal.com

©2025 14392/FEB

